Discount for Lack of Marketability Guide and Toolkit

James R. Hitchner

R. James Alerding

Joshua B. Angell

Katherine E. Morris
To all the professionals who preceded us in the research and analyses on discounts for lack of marketability. You helped lay the groundwork for us. Thank you.

James R. Hitchner

R. James Alerding

Joshua B. Angell

Katherine E. Morris

To my son, Jason Earle Hitchner.

James R. Hitchner

To my wife, Laura, without whose patience and love this would not have happened; and to my family and to the late John McCormick, may he rest in peace.

R. James Alerding

To my father, for everything you’ve done and for always believing. To my mother, for never letting up and for always being there. And, to my brother, Nick, because, without you, life simply wouldn’t be the same. I love you all so deeply. This book is forever dedicated to you all.

Joshua B. Angell

To my parents, John and Elizabeth Francisco.

Katherine E. Morris
| Contents |
|------------------|-------|
| ABOUT THE EDITORS | XIII |
| ABOUT THE AUTHORS | XV  |
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS  | XVII |
| PREFACE           | XIX  |
| CHAPTER 1         |      |
| The Foundation for Discounts for Lack of Marketability | 1 |
| 1.1 Liquidity     | 1    |
| 1.2 Discount for Lack of Liquidity (DLOL) | 2 |
| 1.3 A New Definition for Liquidity with Appropriate Benchmarks | 2 |
| 1.4 Marketability  | 3    |
| 1.5 Discount for Lack of Marketability  | 4    |
| 1.6 A New Definition for Marketability with Appropriate Benchmarks | 4 |
| CHAPTER 2         |      |
| Lack of Marketability Versus Lack of Liquidity | 7 |
| 2.1 Differentiating Between Marketability and Liquidity | 7 |
| 2.2 Degree of Marketability | 11 |
| CHAPTER 3         |      |
| Levels of Value – A Conceptual Framework | 13 |
| 3.1 Levels of Value – Old View | 13 |
| 3.2 Levels of Value – Newer View | 14 |
| 3.3 Levels of Value – Newest View | 15 |
| 3.4 Levels of Value and Liquidity/Marketability Summary | 17 |
| CHAPTER 4         |      |
| Entity-Level Versus Shareholder-Level Discounts | 19 |
CHAPTER 5
Approaches and Methods of Quantifying DLOM

5.1 Qualitative Approaches

5.2 Quantitative Approaches

CHAPTER 6
Overview of Restricted Stock

6.1 Definition of Restricted Stock

6.2 Rule 144

6.3 History of Rule 144

6.4 Definition of an Affiliate

6.5 Registration Rights

6.6 Tolling Rules

6.7 Liquidating Restricted Stock Positions

6.8 Hedging Restricted Stock

6.9 Private Company Stock Versus Restricted Stock

6.10 Conclusion

6.11 Addendum - Rule 144 Examples

CHAPTER 7
Characteristics of Companies Issuing Restricted Stock

7.1 Reasons for Issuing Restricted Stock

7.2 Industry Characteristics

7.3 Size Characteristics

7.4 Volatility Characteristics

7.5 Valuation Characteristics

7.6 Profitability, Dividends, and Distress Characteristics

7.7 Trading Exchange Characteristics

7.8 Conclusion

CHAPTER 8
Discounts on Restricted Stocks

8.1 Restricted Stock Studies

8.2 Dispersion of Discounts

8.3 Computations of Discounts

8.4 Conclusion

CHAPTER 9
Hypotheses Explaining Discounts on Restricted Stock

9.1 Control and Monitoring Cost Hypothesis

9.2 Asymmetric Information Hypothesis

9.3 Assessment of True Value Hypothesis

9.4 Capital Scarcity Hypothesis

9.5 Managerial Entrenchment Hypothesis

9.6 Conclusion
CHAPTER 10
Factors Affecting Restricted Stock Discounts

10.1 Volatility
10.2 Liquidation (Holding) Period
10.3 Registration Rights
10.4 Block Size
10.5 Placement Size
10.6 Firm Size
10.7 Profitability
10.8 Dividends
10.9 Distress/Altman Z-Score
10.10 Valuation Multiples
10.11 Trading Exchange
10.12 Warrants
10.13 Market Reference Price
10.13 Market Conditions
10.14 Type of Investor
10.15 Conclusion

CHAPTER 11
Methods for Calculating DLOM Using Restricted Stock

11.1 Benchmark Study Method
11.2 Specific Transactions Method
11.3 Quintile-Based Method

CHAPTER 12
Review of Large Block Data

12.1 Illiquidity Hypothesis
12.2 Managerial Entrenchment Hypothesis
12.3 Problems with Large Block Data
12.4 Researching Large Block Transactions
12.5 Case Study Example
12.6 Conclusion

CHAPTER 13
Criticism of Restricted Stock Studies

13.1 Lack of Current Market Data
13.2 Risky Issuer Characteristics
13.3 Discounts Imply Unusually High Returns
13.4 Discounts Reflect Other Economic Factors
13.5 Hedging Strategies Should Result in Lower Discounts
13.6 Conclusion
CHAPTER 14
Summaries of Restricted Stock Studies

14.1 Securities and Exchange Commission 139
14.2 The Gelman Study 148
14.3 Trout Study 150
14.4 The Maher Study 154
14.5 Moroney Study 159
14.6 Arneson 163
14.7 Stryker and Pittock 166
14.8 Wruck 168
14.9 Barclay et al. 170
14.10 Hall and Polacek (FMV Opinions Study) 171
14.11 Hertzel and Smith 173
14.12 Management Planning, Inc. Studies 175
14.13 Silber 185
14.14 Willamette Management Associates Study 189
14.15 Bajaj, Denis, Ferris, and Sarin 190
14.16 Johnson Study 196
14.17 The Columbia Financial Advisors, Inc. Studies 198
14.18 The SRR Restricted Stock Study 200
14.19 Trugman Valuation Associates, Inc. (TVA) Restricted Stock Studies 259
14.20 FMV Opinions Study 218
14.21 LiquiStat Study 242

CHAPTER 15
Pre-IPO Studies

15.1 Emory Studies 249
15.2 Willamette Management Associates Pre-IPO Studies 253
15.3 Hitchner and Morris Pre-IPO Studies 256
15.4 Valuation Advisors’ Lack of Marketability Discount Study and Database 259
15.5 Analysis of Valuation Advisors’ Lack of Marketability Discount Study and DLOM Database 263
15.6 Management Analysis and Discussion Section of Public Company Disclosures 266
15.7 Criticisms of Pre-IPO Studies 272
15.8 Recent IRS Court Cases 277
15.9 Conclusions 279

CHAPTER 16
Application of a DLOM/DLOL to a Controlling Interest

16.1 Control DLOM/DLOL Issues 281
16.2 Hitchner, Pratt, and Fishman View 282
21.7 NICE (Nonmarketable Investment Company Evaluation) Method 371
21.8 Addendum 372

CHAPTER 22
Other Models Based on Market Data 375
22.1 The Bid-Ask Spread Method 375
22.2 LEAPS 379

APPENDIX A
Case Study and Sample Report Language Non-Dividend-Paying Company 383
History and Nature 383
Valuation of Equity 384
Analysis of Discount for Lack of Marketability 385
Conclusion 408

APPENDIX B
Case Study and Sample Report Language Dividend-Paying Company 409
History and Nature 409
Valuation of Equity 410
Analysis of Discount for Lack of Marketability 411
Conclusion 434

APPENDIX C
Discount for Lack of Marketability 435
Table of Contents 437
A. Executive Summary 439
B. Introduction 441
C. General Marketability Discount Information 442
1. Marketability Defined 442
2. Factors Influencing Marketability Identified 443
3. Willing Seller Consideration 445
4. Marketability of Minority vs. Controlling Interests 446
5. Sample Initial IDR Items on Marketability 447
D. Summary of Approaches to DLOM 448
1. Benchmark Approaches 449
2. Securities-Based Approaches 465
3. Analytical Approaches 471
4. Other Approaches 483
E. Evaluation and Recommendations 494
F. Summary and Conclusions 502
G. Bibliography 503
Table 1 Analysis of SEC Institutional Investors Restricted Stock Study 507
Table 2 Analysis of MPI Restricted Stock Study 508
Exhibit A—Review FMV Restricted Stock Model 509
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attachment 1</th>
<th>515</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attachment 2</td>
<td>517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attachment 3</td>
<td>518</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exhibit B—Pre-IPO Studies</td>
<td>519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exhibit C—Analytical Approach Revisited</td>
<td>521</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### APPENDIX D

**“Do Put Option Models Overstate Discounts for Lack of Marketability?”** 529

### APPENDIX E

**Definition of the Coefficient of Determination r²** 533

### APPENDIX F

**Summary User Manual: Discount for Lack of Marketability Toolkit** 535

- Version 1.0 Beta Dated January 2015 535

### APPENDIX G

**FMV Opinions Restricted Stock Database** 539

- Levels of Value 540
- What You Need to Know 542
- Summary of Salient Facts 542
- Conclusion 545

### APPENDIX H

**Pluris DLOM Database Exhibits** 549

- All Transactions 549
- Transactions Excluding Warrants 563

### APPENDIX I

**FMV Opinions** 579

### APPENDIX J

**Court Case Summaries** 593

### BIBLIOGRAPHY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Articles</th>
<th>821</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Books</td>
<td>826</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Websites &amp; Blogs</td>
<td>827</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>827</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Referenced Court Cases</td>
<td>831</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
James R. Hitchner, CPA/ABV/CFF, ASA, is the managing director of Financial Valuation Advisors, Inc. in Ventnor City, NJ. He is also president of the Financial Consulting Group, LLC, a national association of professional services firms dedicated to excellence in valuation, financial, and litigation consulting. He is CEO of Valuation Products and Services, LLC, a company that develops educational resources for valuation analysts and fraud/forensics practitioners. He holds the AICPA specialty designations of Accredited in Business Valuation (ABV) and Certified in Financial Forensics (CFF) and is an Accredited Senior Appraiser (ASA) with the American Society of Appraisers. Mr. Hitchner has over 35 years of experience in valuation services. He has often testified as a qualified expert witness on valuations in federal and state courts in numerous states. He has coauthored over 20 courses, taught over 60 courses, published over 100 articles, and made over 200 conference presentations. Mr. Hitchner is coauthor of the book Valuation for Financial Reporting: Fair Value, Business Combinations, Intangible Assets, Goodwill, and Impairment Analysis (2011); editor/coauthor of the book Financial Valuation Applications and Models (FVAM) (2017); and coauthor of the book Financial Valuation Workbook (FVW) (2017) — all published by John Wiley & Sons. He is coauthor, along with Shannon Pratt and Jay Fishman, of PPC’s Guide to Business Valuations (2017), published by Thomson Reuters. He is also coauthor of Hitchner Pratt Fishman, A Consensus View Q&A Guide to Financial Valuation, (2016), published by Valuation Products and Services, LLC. He is editor in chief of Financial Valuation and Litigation Expert, a bimonthly journal that presents views and tools from some of the leading experts in valuation, forensics/fraud, and litigation services. He is an inductee in the AICPA Business Valuation Hall of Fame and a two-time recipient of the AICPA’s Business Valuation Volunteer of the Year award. He was also one of the only four members of the original AICPA Business Valuation Standards Writing Task Force and served the entire six years up to the June 2007 official release of the standards. Mr. Hitchner is past chairman of the Business Valuation Committee of the Georgia Society of CPAs, past member of the AICPA Business Valuation Subcommittee, past member of the AICPA ABV Exam Committee, and past chairman of the ABV Exam Review Course Committee.
Katherine E. Morris, MBA, ASA, is the president of Morris Valuation Consulting, Inc., providing valuation and consulting services to a variety of industries. With over 20 years of experience, Ms. Morris has provided valuation analyses of business and intangible assets for diverse purposes, including financial reporting under Statement of Financial Accounting Standards Nos. 805 and 820 and reporting under IFRS; estate and gift tax reporting; merger and acquisition planning; and in the context of litigation and property tax disputes. Ms. Morris has performed work on behalf of the Internal Revenue Service and the Attorney General of the State of Georgia, as well as work to be presented to the Internal Revenue Service, the Department of Justice, and Office of the Inspector General. Through the course of her career, she has performed analyses on a wide variety of entities including hospitals, physician practices, imaging centers and biotechnology companies, auto dealerships, technology and management consulting companies, telecommunication companies, financial institutions, insurance companies, hotel and restaurant chains, building and consumer products retailers, wholesalers, manufacturers, and entities in the energy industry. Ms. Morris was formerly with Phillips Hitchner Group, Inc., Ernst & Young, Financial Valuation Advisors, Inc., and American Appraisal, Inc. She is also a managing director with Valuation Products and Services, LLC, the publisher of this VPS DLOM Guide & Toolkit.
About the Authors

James R. Hitchner, CPA/ABV/CFF, ASA. See “About the Editors.”

R. James Alerding, CPA/ABV, ASA, is owner of Alerding Consulting, LLC, established in 2012 to provide a wide range of valuation and forensic consulting and general business consulting services. He holds the AICPA specialty designation of Accredited in Business Valuation (ABV) and is an Accredited Senior Appraiser (ASA) with the American Society of Appraisers. Mr. Alerding has over 50 years of financial/accounting/investment experience, including over 35 years of business valuation experience. He has taught over 40 valuation courses, published numerous articles, and made over 100 business valuation presentations. He has been recognized as an expert witness in several states and has testified approximately 500 times in depositions and trials. Mr. Alerding is the author of *Valuation of a Closely Held Business* and *Purchase or Sale of a Closely Held Business* as part of the Tax Advisors Planning Series, published by Research Institute of America, and he coauthored *The Handbook for Divorce Valuations* and *Financial Valuation Applications and Models*, a treatise on business valuation published by John Wiley & Sons. He was a member of the writing task force for the AICPA Statement on Standards for Valuation Services No. 1 (SSVS), is a past member of the AICPA Business Valuation Subcommittee, and an AICPA Business Valuation Hall of Fame member.

Joshua B. Angell, CFA, ASA, is the senior managing director of the Valuation Advisory Services and Litigation Practice Group of Moore, Ellrich & Neal, P.A., a valuation, consultancy, tax, and accounting services firm located in Palm Beach Gardens, FL. During his employment, Mr. Angell has overseen hundreds of valuations of privately held companies for a variety of purposes, including M&A, shareholder dispute, gift and estate tax, divorce, and eminent domain. Mr. Angell also has developed extensive experience estimating economic damages, including damages for lost profits and loss in business value, valuing intellectual property, and valuing complex securities and derivatives, including options, restricted securities, convertible preferred stock, and mortgage-backed securities. Mr. Angell has been involved in hundreds of complex litigation-related matters and has testified as an expert witness in several cases and arbitrations. His industry experience spans the
retail, wholesale, manufacturing, aerospace, defense, consulting, education, automobile, consumer discretionary, technology, oil and gas, real estate, insurance, and construction sectors. Mr. Angell graduated valedictorian, summa cum laude from Florida State University with a BS degree in accounting and finance. Mr. Angell holds the Chartered Financial Analyst designation from CFA Institute and is an Accredited Senior Appraiser (ASA) with a business valuation specialty from the American Society of Appraisers. He is also a Registered Investment Advisor in the State of Florida. Mr. Angell writes extensively on business valuation-related topics, including valuation theory, liquidity, cost of capital, and economic damages, among other topics. In 2016, Mr. Angell was named “40 Under Forty” by the National Association of Certified Valuators and Analysts (NACVA) for his dedication to excellence and his willingness to share his knowledge and experience with the professional valuation community. Mr. Angell is also the founder of The Barrons Group, LLC, a global financial advisory services firm, and the founder and chief investment officer of TBG Capital Management, LP, an event-driven and value-focused investment partnership that he established for purposes of investing in undervalued securities and special situations arbitrage transactions across the capital structure on a global basis.

Katherine E. Morris, MBA, ASA. See “About the Editors.”
Acknowledgements

These professionals reviewed the entire text. Their insight and suggestion were invaluable.

Jay E. Fishman, FASA, Managing Director, Financial Research Associates, Bala Cynwood, PA.

Michael Gregory, MBA, ASA, CVA, Chief Manager, Michael Gregory Consulting, Roseville, MN.

Harold G. Martin, Jr., CPA/ABV/CFF, ASA, CFE, Partner, Keiter, Richmond, VA.

Shannon P. Pratt, DBA, FASA, CFA, MCBA, CM&AA, MCBC, chairman and CEO, Shannon Pratt Valuations, Portland, OR.

Karen Warner, M.A., is managing editor for Valuation Products and Services, LLP (VPS). Janet Kern, B.A., is director of operations for VPS. They did an outstanding job in editing this Guide and keeping things organized. We very much appreciate their hard work and patience.

We would also like to thank the following for the use of certain information:

- Alina V. Niculita
- American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
- American Society of Appraisers
- Ashok Abbott
- Aswath Damodaran
- Bloomberg
- Brian K. Pearson
- Business Valuation Resources
- Business Valuation Review
- David B. Chaffe III
- David Tabak
- Discount for Lack of Marketability: Job Aid for IRS Valuation Professionals
- Duff & Phelps
Eric Nath
Espen Robak
EV Energy Partners, LP
Financial Accounting Standards Board
Financial Analysts Journal
Financial Management
Financial Consulting Group
Financial Valuation and Litigation Expert
FMV Opinions, Inc.
Francis A. Longstaff
Harvard Business Review
Internal Revenue Service
International Glossary of Business Valuation Terms
Investopedia
James R. Hitchner
Jay E. Fishman
John D. Emory Sr.
John D. Finnerty
John J. Stockdale
John Wiley & Sons
Joshua B. Angell
Journal of Applied Business Research
Journal of Applied Finance
Journal of Corporate Finance
Journal of Corporation Law
Journal of Financial Economics
Journal of Economics and Management
Journal of Law and Economics
Katherine E. Morris
Lance S. Hall
LiquiStat
Management Planning Inc.
Marc S. Katsanis
Marc Vianello
McGraw Hill
Mercer Capital
Michael A. Gregory
Morningstar
Mukesh Bajaj
National Association of Certified Valuators and Analysts
NERA Economic Consulting
Partnership Profiles, Inc.
PlacementTracker
Pluris Valuation Advisors
Risk Management Association
Restricted Stock Study authors
R. James Alerding
Ronald M. Seaman
Shannon P. Pratt
Shannon Pratt Valuations
Standard & Poor’s
Stillian Ghaidarov
Stout Risius Ross
Taxes – The Tax Magazine
The Appraisal Foundation
The Journal of Business
The Journal of Derivatives
The Journal of Finance
The Journal of Taxation
The Value Examiner
The Yale Law Journal
Thomson Reuters
Trugman Valuation Associates
Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice
U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission.
Valuation Products and Services
Valuation Strategies
Z. Christopher Mercer
PREFACE

The VPS DLOM Guide and Toolkit is a powerful tool for considering, calculating, and defending discounts for lack of marketability. While the Guide is a powerful source of information and excellent tool in its own right, we suggest use of the accompanying but separate Toolkit to maximize this product’s usefulness.

This VPS DLOM Guide begins by laying a solid foundation. Terms frequently used in the determination of discounts for lack of marketability (DLOM) are clearly defined to strengthen the reader’s core understanding of the process. DLOM approaches and methods from both the past and present are explored, including analyses of their strengths and weaknesses.

The VPS DLOM Guide presents the most detailed analysis of restricted stock studies ever published, including the important characteristics of the companies who issue such stock. It considers the factors that affect restricted stock discounts and offers methods for calculating DLOM. There are also insightful analyses of the most common restricted stock transaction databases, again with comments on strengths and weaknesses.

The VPS DLOM Guide also presents a detailed look at pre-IPO studies and option pricing models. Shareholder cashflow models, including the Quantitative Marketability Discount Model, are addressed, along with other models and studies.

In the Appendices, the reader will find case studies and sample report language for both a dividend and non-dividend-paying company, guiding the reader through the actual process of applying a DLOM. A complete reproduction of the IRS DLOM Job Aid for Valuation Professionals is included in this text, allowing for quick and easy reference. An additional excellent reference aid is an appendix of over 90 DLOM-related court cases.

In addition to this Guide, the separate VPS DLOM Toolkit, available at http://www.valuationproducts.com/DLOMToolkit.html, includes 10 Excel models with User Manuals including:

- Restricted stock calculator to allowing for detailed comparison of subject company characteristics to restricted stock transactions, adjusting the data for differences in holding period and volatility between the subject and the transactions. The model incorporates option methodology and includes a qualitative factors assessment tool.

- Frequently used option models for the calculation of DLOM based on subject company specifications input by the user

- A summary version of the QMDM calculator

- All models include report-ready exhibits
We welcome all feedback. If you have comments, suggestions, or a question, please email me at jhitchner@finvaluation.com.

James R. Hitchner, CPA/ABV/CFF/ASA
Managing Director, Financial Valuation Advisors
CEO, Valuation Products and Services
President, Financial Consulting Group