

THIRD EDITION

EXCERPT FROM

# Business Valuation and Bankruptcy



CASE LAW COMPENDIUM

**BVR**  
What It's Worth



---

# Business Valuation and Bankruptcy Case Law Compendium

---

THIRD EDITION



111 SW Columbia St, Suite 750, Portland, OR 97201  
(503) 479-8200 • [www.bvresources.com](http://www.bvresources.com)



## **What It's Worth**

Copyright © 2021 by Business Valuation Resources, LLC (BVR). All rights reserved.  
Printed in the United States of America.

No part of this publication may be reprinted, reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, scanning or otherwise, except as permitted under Sections 107 or 108 of the 1976 United States Copyright Act, without either the prior written permission of the Publisher or authorization through payment of the appropriate per copy fee to the Publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed to the Permissions Department, Business Valuation Resources, LLC, 111 SW Columbia St, Suite 750, Portland, OR 97201; (503) 479-8200; fax (503) 291-7955; [permissions@bvresources.com](mailto:permissions@bvresources.com).

Information contained in this book has been obtained by Business Valuation Resources from sources believed to be reliable. However, neither Business Valuation Resources nor its authors guarantee the accuracy or completeness of any information published herein and neither Business Valuation Resources nor its authors shall be responsible for any errors, omissions, or damages arising out of use of this information. This work is published with the understanding that Business Valuation Resources and its authors are supplying information but are not attempting to render business valuation or other professional services. If such services are required, the assistance of an appropriate professional should be sought.

Editor: Andrew Dzamba

Executive Legal Editor: Sylvia Golden

Managing Editor: Monique Nijhout-Rowe

Senior Copy Editor: David Solomon

Chair and CEO: David Foster

President: Lucretia Lyons

Chief Revenue Officer: Lisa McInturff

ISBN: 978-1-62150-222-7 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-62150-223-4 (PDF)

ISBN: 978-1-62150-224-1 (EPUB)

ISSN: 2325-338X (Print)

ISSN: 2767-2840 (PDF)

# Table of Contents

---

<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	<b>7</b>
<b>PART I. LATEST INSIGHTS</b> .....	<b>9</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1. WHEN CRISIS HITS: THE IMPACT OF THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC ON BANKRUPTCY VALUATIONS</b> .....	<b>11</b>
<b>CHAPTER 2. WHAT THE NEW SUBCHAPTER V IN BANKRUPTCY MEANS TO BUSINESS VALUERS</b> .....	<b>21</b>
<b>CHAPTER 3. TIPS ON HANDLING 10 KEY ISSUES IN BANKRUPTCY VALUATIONS</b> .....	<b>23</b>
<b>CHAPTER 4. CHOOSE YOUR CLIENT WISELY IN A BANKRUPTCY ENGAGEMENT</b> .....	<b>27</b>
<b>CHAPTER 5. THE USE OF FINANCIAL PROJECTIONS IN SOLVENCY OPINIONS</b> .....	<b>29</b>
By Craig Jacobson, B. Riley Advisory Services (New York, N.Y., USA)	
<b>PART II. COURT CASE DIGESTS</b> .....	<b>35</b>
<b>COURT CASE SUMMARY TABLE</b> .....	<b>37</b>
<b>COURT CASE DIGESTS</b> .....	<b>45</b>
<i>Adelphia Recovery Trust v. FPL Group, Inc. (In re Adelphia Corp.)</i> .....	45
<i>In re Aerogroup International, Inc.</i> .....	50
<i>Alberts v. HCA, Inc.</i> .....	56
<i>In re Alta+Cast LLC</i> .....	59
<i>American Classic Voyages Co. v. JP Morgan Chase Bank (I)</i> .....	60
<i>American Classic Voyages Co. v. JP Morgan Chase Bank (II)</i> .....	62
<i>In re American Home Mortgage Holdings, Inc. (I)</i> .....	64
<i>In re American Home Mortgage Holdings, Inc. (II)</i> .....	66
<i>In re American Homepatient, Inc.</i> .....	68
<i>In re: American Suzuki Motor Corporation</i> .....	69
<i>Antioch Co. Litig. Trust v. Morgan</i> .....	72
<i>Ardmor Vending v. Kim</i> .....	75
<i>ASARCO v. Americas Mining Corp. (I)</i> .....	76
<i>ASARCO v. Americas Mining Corp. (II)</i> .....	82
<i>In re Bachrach Clothing, Inc.</i> .....	84
<i>Bakst v. United States of America (In re: Kane &amp; Kane)</i> .....	89
<i>Bank of America, N.A. v. Veluchamy (In re Veluchamy)</i> .....	92
<i>In re Bartomeli</i> .....	97
<i>In re Body Transit</i> .....	98
<i>In re Boston Generating</i> .....	103
<i>Boyer v. Crown Stock Distribution, Inc.</i> .....	106
<i>In re Breitburn Energy Partners LP</i> .....	108
<i>Burtch v. Opus, LLC (In re Opus East, LLC) (I)</i> .....	114
<i>Burtch v. Opus, LLC (In re Opus East, LLC) (II)</i> .....	118

<i>In re Capmark Financial Group</i> .....	123
<i>In re Case No. 800 Bourbon St.</i> .....	126
<i>In re Certified HR Service Co. (II)</i> .....	129
<i>Charles J. Lisle, Trustee v. John Wiley &amp; Sons, Inc.</i> .....	133
<i>In re Chemtura Corp. (I)</i> .....	134
<i>In re Chemtura Corp. (II)</i> .....	138
<i>In re Chrysler LLC.</i> .....	140
<i>In re Civic Partners Sioux City, LLC</i> .....	142
<i>In re Cole</i> .....	147
<i>In re Colonial Realty Company; Hirsch v. Steinberg (II)</i> .....	151
<i>In re Coram Healthcare Corp.</i> .....	153
<i>Crane v. Morris (In re Morris)</i> .....	155
<i>In re Dawes</i> .....	156
<i>In re DBSD North America, Inc.</i> .....	157
<i>Dietz v. Jacobs.</i> .....	160
<i>DMC Investment Corporation v. Pincrest Investment Co., et al.</i> .....	163
<i>Doctors Hospital of Hyde Park, Inc. v. Desnick et al.</i> .....	164
<i>In re Eastman Kodak Company</i> .....	168
<i>EBC I, Inc. v. America Online, Inc.</i> .....	171
<i>In re EM Lodgings, LLC</i> .....	174
<i>In re Emerge Energy Services LP</i> .....	177
<i>In re Fairvue Club Properties</i> .....	184
<i>In re Frezzo</i> .....	186
<i>In re Genco Shipping &amp; Trading Ltd.</i> .....	187
<i>In re Global Technovations, Inc. (I)</i> .....	192
<i>In re Global Technovations, Inc. (II)</i> .....	194
<i>In re Global Technovations, Inc. (III)</i> .....	196
<i>In re Glueck</i> .....	199
<i>In re Greater Southeast Community Hospital Corp. (I)</i> .....	200
<i>In re Greater Southeast Community Hospital Corp. (II)</i> .....	201
<i>In re Greater Southeast Community Hospital Corp. (III)</i> .....	206
<i>H.G. Roebuck &amp; Son, Inc. v. Alter Communications</i> .....	211
<i>Hanckel v. Campbell (In re Hanckel)</i> .....	213
<i>In re Harper</i> .....	217
<i>Healthco International v. Hicks, Muse &amp; Co.</i> .....	218
<i>In re Hechinger Investment Company of Delaware, Inc.</i> .....	220
<i>In re Hechinger Investment Company of Delaware</i> .....	222
<i>Heilig Meyers Co. v. Internal Revenue Service</i> .....	223
<i>Holber v. M&amp;T Bank (In re Scheffler)</i> .....	225
<i>In re Horsehead Holding Corp.</i> .....	229
<i>In re Houston Drywall, Inc.</i> .....	232
<i>In re Jonatzke</i> .....	234
<i>Joseph D. Olsen, Trustee of Huntley Ready Mix, Inc. v. Gary A. Floit</i> .....	236
<i>In re Joy Recovery Tech. Corp.; Daley v. Chang</i> .....	238
<i>In re Jumer's Castle Lodge, Inc.</i> .....	241
<i>Kool, Mann, Coffee &amp; Co., et al. v. L. Coleman Coffey, et al.</i> .....	242
<i>LaSalle National Bank Association v. Paloian</i> .....	244
<i>In re Lason, Inc.</i> .....	248
<i>In re Lehman Bros. Holdings Inc.</i> .....	249
<i>In re: LightSquared Inc.</i> .....	252
<i>In Re: LMR, LLC</i> .....	255

<i>In re Louis Frey Company, Inc.</i> . . . . .	259
<i>In re Magna Cum Latte, Inc.</i> . . . . .	263
<i>McDuffie v. O'Neal</i> . . . . .	265
<i>In re Med Diversified, Inc. (I)</i> . . . . .	267
<i>In re Med Diversified, Inc. (II)</i> . . . . .	269
<i>In re Mercury Companies, Inc. (I)</i> . . . . .	273
<i>In re Mercury Companies, Inc. (II)</i> . . . . .	276
<i>Miller Bros. Coal v. Consol of Kentucky, Inc.</i> . . . . .	280
<i>Monsanto Co. v. Roeder</i> . . . . .	281
<i>Monticello Arcade v. Lyall</i> . . . . .	283
<i>Mungo v. Taylor</i> . . . . .	284
<i>In re Nanovation Technologies, Inc</i> . . . . .	285
<i>In re Nellson Nutraceutical (I)</i> . . . . .	288
<i>In re Nellson Nutraceutical (II)</i> . . . . .	290
<i>Nelson v. Walnut Investment Partners</i> . . . . .	293
<i>Nesser v. Boston Restaurants</i> . . . . .	295
<i>Official Committee of Unsecured Creditors v. Calpers Corp. Partners, LLC</i> . . . . .	296
<i>In re Oglesby</i> . . . . .	302
<i>In re Oneida Ltd.</i> . . . . .	303
<i>Paloian v. LaSalle Bank</i> . . . . .	306
<i>In re Parnes</i> . . . . .	309
<i>Peltz v. Hatten</i> . . . . .	310
<i>Pension Benefits Guaranty Corp. v. CF&amp;I Fabricators (In re: CF&amp;I Fabricators)</i> . . . . .	312
<i>Pereira v. Dow Chem. Co. (In re Trace Int'l Holdings, Inc.)</i> . . . . .	313
<i>Post-Confirmation Communication for Small Loans, Inc. v. Martin</i> . . . . .	314
<i>In re Premier Entertainment Biloxi LLC</i> . . . . .	319
<i>In re Prince</i> . . . . .	321
<i>Pryor v. Tiffen (In re TC Liquidations LLC)</i> . . . . .	322
<i>In re PWS Holding Corporation</i> . . . . .	325
<i>r2 Advisors, LLC v. Equitable Oil Purchasing Co. (In re Red Eagle Oil, Inc.)</i> . . . . .	326
<i>Redmond v. NCMIC Fin. Corp. (In re Brooke Corp.)</i> . . . . .	329
<i>In re Residential Capital, LLC</i> . . . . .	333
<i>Lippe v. Bairnco Corp. (I)</i> . . . . .	336
<i>Lippe v. Bairnco Corp. (II)</i> . . . . .	339
<i>Lippe v. Bairnco Corp. (III)</i> . . . . .	339
<i>In re Robert E. Mahoney, Jr. Debtor</i> . . . . .	341
<i>Samson v. Western Capital Partners LLC (In re Blixseth)</i> . . . . .	344
<i>In re South Canaan Cellular Investments</i> . . . . .	348
<i>In re Spansion</i> . . . . .	350
<i>In re Spielfogel</i> . . . . .	353
<i>Stadtmueller v. Fitzgerald (In re Epic Cycle Interactive, Inc.)</i> . . . . .	354
<i>In re Sunedison, Inc.</i> . . . . .	359
<i>Superior Offshore International, Inc. v. Schaefer</i> . . . . .	363
<i>In the Matter of TCI 2 Holdings, LLC</i> . . . . .	364
<i>In re Terrestar Networks, Inc.</i> . . . . .	367
<i>In re Thomas, Debtors</i> . . . . .	369
<i>Tidwell v. Leskosky</i> . . . . .	370
<i>In re TOUSA, Inc.</i> . . . . .	371
<i>Trans World Airlines, debtor v. Trans World Airlines Official Committee of Unsecured Creditors</i> . . . . .	377
<i>In re Tribune Co.</i> . . . . .	379
<i>In re Tronox Incorporated</i> . . . . .	383

<i>U.S. Bank N.A. v. Verizon Communications Inc.</i> . . . . .	389
<i>United Airlines, Inc. v. Regional Airports Improvement Corp.</i> . . . . .	393
<i>Valley Vulcan Mold v. AMPCO</i> . . . . .	396
<i>In re Valley-Vulcan Mold Co., Debtor</i> . . . . .	397
<i>VFB LLC v. Campbell Soup Co. (II)</i> . . . . .	398
<i>In re Village at Camp Bowie I, L.P.</i> . . . . .	400
<i>Villaje del Rio, Ltd. v. Colina del Rio, L.P.</i> . . . . .	403
<i>Vision-Park Properties v. Seaside Engineering</i> . . . . .	404
<i>Waller v. Pidgeon</i> . . . . .	407
<i>In re Washington Mutual, Inc.</i> . . . . .	409
<i>Weinman v. Crowley (In re Blair)</i> . . . . .	413
<i>Weisfelner v. Blavatnik (In re Lyondell Chem. Co.)</i> . . . . .	416
<i>In re Westpointe, L.P. (II)</i> . . . . .	422
<i>In re White</i> . . . . .	424
<i>Whyte v. C/R Energy Coinvestment II, L.P. (In re SemCrud)</i> . . . . .	426
<i>In re Winstar Communication, Inc.</i> . . . . .	430
<i>In re Yellowstone Mountain Club, LLC</i> . . . . .	431
<i>In re Young Broadcasting, Inc.</i> . . . . .	435

**BVR provides readers with access to the courts' full opinions for all case digests featured in this compendium.**

**We invite you to go to  
[www.bvresources.com/bankruptycases](http://www.bvresources.com/bankruptycases)  
and log in to access the decisions.**



---

## Introduction

---

Almost every single bankruptcy case involves valuation in some way and at practically every stage of the case. This third edition of BVR's *Business Valuation & Bankruptcy: Case Law Compendium* is designed to help practitioners stay up to date on case law and emerging methods and techniques for valuing financially distressed businesses and assets. It is also designed to save hours of research time by organizing and analyzing bankruptcy-related court cases in which valuation issues play an important role.

Financially distressed and bankrupt businesses have a history of unpredictable behavior, and the current environment has heightened the level of uncertainty. There are also more opportunities for practitioners to become involved in bankruptcy-related valuation engagements. With that in mind, the first section of this book includes several articles (all new to this edition) that provide the latest insights into the valuation of financially distressed businesses. The articles cover:

- The impact of COVID-19;
- Implications of the new Subchapter V;
- Valuation issues that require special attention:
- Why the choice of client is not as simple as you might think; and
- The use of financial projections, which are under increased scrutiny.

Most of this book is devoted to the analysis of case law—it contains over 140 digests of court decisions related to valuation issues in bankruptcy matters. These digests contain in-depth analysis of the valuation issues in the cases and are written by the BVR legal team. The roster of cases has been fully updated since the last edition. Plus, there is a handy summary table of cases (by jurisdiction) that gives you the case name, date, specific court, and the main valuation issue in the case. From the table, you can quickly refer to the case digest for an analysis and other details, such as

the names of the judge and valuation experts involved (when known). You can also access the full court opinions from BVR's *BVLaw* database.<sup>1</sup>

We hope this book helps practitioners prepare more logical and supportable bankruptcy valuations. In addition, we hope this book also helps legal counsel, trustees, triers of fact, and other interested parties have a better understanding of what goes into a defensible bankruptcy valuation analysis.



Andrew Dzamba  
Executive Editor  
Business Valuation Resources

---

<sup>1</sup> BVR is pleased to offer you access to the courts' full opinions of all cases referenced in this compendium. Please visit [bvresources.com/bankruptcycases](http://bvresources.com/bankruptcycases) and log in to access this resource.

# Business intelligence at your fingertips.

## About Business Valuation Resources

Every informed stakeholder in business valuation, performance benchmarking, or risk assessment turns to Business Valuation Resources (BVR) for authoritative deal and market data, news and research, training, and expert opinion. Trust BVR for unimpeachable business valuation intelligence. BVR's data, publications, and analysis have won in the boardroom and the courtroom for over two decades.

### Deal & Market Data

- DealStats
- Cost of Capital Professional
- Valuation Benchmarking Platform
- Guideline Public Company Comps Tool
- BIZCOMPS
- Economic Outlook Update
- FactSet Mergerstat/BVR Control Premium Study
- Stout Restricted Stock Study™
- Valuation Advisors Discount for Lack of Marketability Study
- ktMINE Royalty Rate Data & License Agreements
- First Research Industry, State & Province Profiles
- BizMiner Industry Financial Reports
- Mergerstat Review & Mergerstat Review Monthly
- Butler Pinkerton Calculator – Total Cost of Equity and Public Company Specific Risk Calculator
- Vertical IQ - U.S. and Canada Industry Profiles
- RCReports

### Guides, Books & Reports

- Digital Library
- Guides & Books
- Special Reports
- Legal Compendiums
- Yearbooks

### Training & CPE

- Webinars
- Web Workshops & Special Series
- Desktop Learning Centers
- Self-study CPE
- eLearning courses

### News & Research

- BVRResearch Pro
- Business Valuation Update
- BVLaw
- Economic Outlook Update
- Business Reference Guide Online

Learn more about all of our offerings at:  
**[bvresources.com](http://bvresources.com)**